Claim 1

Apparatus for cleaning water,

Independent apparatus (product) claim, defines the field of the invention as equipment which is suitable for removing entrained detritus and particles from water

Because "for" means <u>suitable</u> for by patent drafting convention; cleaning includes removing large detritus (e.g. leaves and moss) and smaller particles [page 5, lines 3-4 and 12-13]

the apparatus comprising

the apparatus includes, but is not limited to, the features that follow because this is the conventional usage in patent specifications

a holding tank with a central aperture

holding tank = a vessel in which water is retained for a period of time

because the purpose of the holding tank is to retain water for a period of time while small particles settle out [page 5, lines 6-13].

Central aperture = a hole which is located approximately in the centre of the holding tank;

Because page 6, lines 27 – 30 explains that the hole does not need to be exactly central; nonetheless, the word "central" must have some limiting effect.

through which extends an upstanding pipe,

"which" refers to the aperture rather than the holding tank because this is apparent from Figs 1 & 2 extends = the pipe runs from below the aperture to above the aperture because this is set out on page 4, lines 19-20

upstanding = generally vertical because the skilled person would understand that being exactly vertical is not essential

pipe = a tube because this is stated on page 4, line 19

the uppermost edge of which providing a weir,

Uppermost edge = top end (normal meaning); "which" must refer to the tube; because it cannot refer to the aperture, or the holding tank, because the upper edges of these can't provide a weir weir = a low dam which regulates the level and flow of water because the purpose of the weir is to retain water temporarily to allow particles to settle out (see page 5, lines 6-8)

the holding tank having a filter material provided across its top.

Filter material = something which removes entrained detritus, e.g. a mesh because this is the purpose of the filter material (see page 5, lines 2-4 and 6)

Across its top: the filter must extend at least across the flow path of the water into the holding tank above the weir because the purpose of the filter is to remove entrained particles.

However, it is not necessary for this purpose for the filter to cover the whole of the upper surface of the holding tank, nor for it to be situated exactly at the top and because Figure 1 shows the mesh (23) = the filter located just below the upper edge of the holding tank (15)

Claim 2

Water cleaning and storage apparatus, the apparatus comprising

Separate independent claim apparatus claim;

equipment which is suitable for removing entrained detritus and particles from water and also for holding the water that has been cleaned until it is used

Because "for" means <u>suitable</u> for by patent drafting convention; cleaning includes removing large detritus (e.g. leaves and moss) and smaller particles [page 5, lines 3-4 and 12-13]; the water that has been is then held in the equipment until used [page 6, lines 7 – 10]

comprising has meaning set out for claim 1

a water storage tank having a top wall through which a pipe extends,

water storage tank means a vessel for holding the cleaned water until it is used

because this is the purpose of the storage tank, as set out at page 5, lines 18-21

top wall means the upper surface of the storage tank

because this is set out at page 6, lines 7 – 10 and is the structure shown in Figure 2 (labelled 103)

a pipe = a tube because this is shown in Figure 2

"which" refers to the top wall rather than the storage tank because this is apparent from Figure 2

extends = the tube runs from below the top wall, though it, to above the top wall because this is set out on page 4, lines 19-20

one end of the pipe providing a weir,

"one end of the pipe" means the upper part of the pipe above the top wall because the lower end of the pipe cannot fulfil this purpose; and the upper edge on its own cannot serve the purpose of providing a weir. The description uses the word "weir 106" to refer to the pipe, rather than the upper edge (see page 5, lines 26 - 28).

weir = a low dam which regulates the level and flow of water because the purpose of the weir is to retain water temporarily in a water settling volume to allow particles to settle out (see page 5, lines 26 - 28 and 33 - 34);

a peripheral wall upstands from the storage tank to provide a holding tank

peripheral = outermost because this is its normal meaning

upstands from the storage tank to provide a holding tank means that the peripheral wall extends above the top wall of the storage tank so that the top wall and the peripheral wall together form a vessel for temporarily retaining water while particles settle out because this is set out on page 5, lines 19-20 and 33-34, and is shown in Figure 2 as wall extension 104

and wherein a filter material is secured over and between the peripheral wall.

Filter material = something which removes entrained detritus, e.g. a mesh because this is the purpose of the filter material (see page 5, lines 2-4 and 6)

Secured over and between the peripheral wall means attached to the peripheral and located above its upper edge and extending across the top of the holding tank because this is shown in Figure 2 and set out on page 5, line 23

Claim 3

Apparatus according to Claim 1 or 2, comprising

Apparatus which has all of the features of claim 1 or claim 2 plus those that follow (comprising = includes but not limited to, as set out for claim 1)

[when dependent on claim 1] a wall sloping from or to the pipe.

Wall sloping to or from the pipe = the bottom surface of the holding tank which is inclined to the horizontal, either towards or away from the pipe because this is shown in Figure 1 (base 11, see page 4, line 18) and Figure 2 (top wall 103, see page 5, lines19-20)

[when dependent on claim 2] a wall sloping from or to the pipe.

"a wall" - claim 2 already refers to two walls: the top wall and the peripheral wall; the term "wall" in claim 3 must refer to the top wall, because Figure 2 shows that this is inclined towards or away from the weir 106 (depending on whether the weir is up or down), whereas the peripheral wall is shown as vertical, not sloping).

sloping to or from the pipe = the top wall of the storage tank is inclined to the horizontal either towards or away from the pipe because this is shown in Figure 2 (top wall 103, see page 5, lines19-20)

Claim 4

Apparatus according to any preceding Claim,

Apparatus which has all of the features of claim 1 or claim 2 or claim 3 (when dependent on claim 1 or claim 2) plus those that follow (comprising = includes but not limited to, as set out for claim 1)

wherein the filter material is a mesh,

the filter material is made from a network of threads or wires which define open passages of a regular size because this is the normal meaning of this term

typically fabricated from steel or other metal material having a mesh hole size of from 1 to 10 mm.

typically means that the features which follow are optional, and not limiting because this is patent drafting convention; it is unclear whether this applies to the material only, or also to the hole size steel or other metal material = a metal or metal alloy (steel is just one example)

mesh hole size = the gaps between the threads or wires is within the range of 1 to 10mm because this is the plain meaning

	Claim 1	Construction	Infringement Cleanio (Doc B)	Infringement Cleanipro (Doc B)
1.1	Apparatus for	equipment suitable for	Yes: page 9, lines 9-10	Yes: Cleanipro incorporates Cleanio (page
	cleaning water, the	cleaning water		10, lines 18-25)
	apparatus			
	comprising,			
1.2	a holding tank	a vessel in which water is	Yes: the region defined by the circular wall 2	Yes: as for Cleanio; see page 10, line 23
		retained for a period of	and the lowermost flexible surface 3 forms a	
		time	vessel; water is held on the impermeable	
			lowermost flexible surface 3 for a period of time until sufficient water builds up to overflow.	
			page 9, lines 12-13 & 27; page 10, lines 5-6	
			page 3, lilles 12-13 & 27, page 10, lilles 3-0	
	with a central	a hole which is located	Yes: the lower flexible surface has a central pipe	Yes: as for Cleanio (page 9, lines 13-14)
	aperture	approximately in the centre	5 which extends through the surface (so there	,
	•		must be an aperture). Page 9, lines 13-14	
1.3	through which	generally vertical tube	Yes: The pipe 5 extends through the surface 3	Yes: as for Cleanio (page 9, line 14)
	extends an	which runs from below,	(page 9, line 14); Figures A and B show that the	
	upstanding pipe,	through the aperture,	lower end of the pipe is below the aperture and	
		above it	the top end is above it. The pipe is shown as	
			vertical.	
1.4	the uppermost edge	top end of the tube acts as	Yes: the water builds up until it overflows the	Yes: as for Cleanio (page 10, lines 5-7)
	of which providing a	a low dam which regulates	top end of the pipe page 10, lines 5-7.	
1 5	weir	the level and flow of water	Veer the consent flexible confers is used a fuere a	Vacanta a managat a unifo a a A manada uning
1.5	the holding tank	something which can	Yes: the upper flexible surface is made from a	Yes: uppermost surface 4 made using
	having a filter material provided	remove entrained detritus	plastic mesh material (page 9, line 26), which acts as a filter for incoming water (page 10,	steel mesh (page 10, line 24)
	across its top	at approximately the upper end of the holding tank	lines 3-4). It is located close to the top of the	
	αυτυρο τις τομ	end of the holding talk	circular wall 2 (Fig A)	
			All features present, therefore infringed	All features present, therefore infringed
			/ reatares present, therefore mininged	/ catal co present, therefore mininged

	Claim 2	Construction	Infringement Cleanio (Doc B)	Infringement Cleanipro (Doc B)
2.1	Water cleaning and	equipment suitable for cleaning	No: Cleanio is suitable for cleaning water but	Yes: Cleanipro cleans and holds
	storage apparatus,	water and holding the cleaned water	not for storing water. However it is intended	water in an integral lower tank (page
	the apparatus	until it is used	for use with a butt for storing water (page 2,	10, lines 19-20)
	comprising		lines 14-15).	
2.2	a water storage tank	a vessel for holding the cleaned	No: As above (however, a butt would be	Yes: integral lower tank for storage
		water until it is used	present when in use)	of cleaned water (page 10, lines 19- 20)
	having a top wall	top wall = upper surface of the	No: Cleanio lowermost surface 3 is not part	
		storage tank	of storage tank	Yes: lowermost surface 3 is the upper surface of the storage tank
	through which a	the tube runs from below the top	No: Cleanio has pipe 5 through lowermost	
	pipe extends	wall, though and above it	surface 3 but this is not part of storage tank	Yes: pipe 5 through lowermost surface 3 (page 9, line 14)
2.3	one end of the pipe	the part of the pipe above the top	Yes: the water builds up until it overflows	Yes: the water builds up until it
	providing a weir	wall regulates the level and flow of water	the top end of the pipe page 10, lines 5-7.	overflows the top end of the pipe page 10, lines 5-7.
2.4	a peripheral wall	outermost wall extends above the	No: Circular wall 2 is peripheral and provides	Yes: wall 2 extends above integral
	upstands from the	top wall of the storage tank so that	holding tank, but does not upstand from a	storage tank to provide holding tank
	storage tank to	together they form a vessel for	storage tank (because there is no storage	(page 10, lines 18-19)
	provide a holding	temporarily retaining water	tank)	
	tank			
2.5	and wherein a filter	Filter material = something which	No: filter material is present but is not	No: filter is uppermost surface 4
	material is secured	removes entrained detritus, attached	located above the upper edge of the water	(appears to be the same location as
	over and between	to the peripheral wall and located	butt (when in use)	in Cleanio); this extends internally
	the peripheral wall	above its upper edge and extending		from the wall 2, but is not located
		across the top of the holding tank		above the upper edge of the wall 2.
			2.1, 2.2, 2.4 and 2.5 not present, therefore	2.5 is not present, therefore not
			not directly infringed. 2.1, 2.2 and 2.4	infringed
			would be present when Cleanio is installed	
			on a water butt. However, 2.5 is not	NB could now consider equivalents
			present, therefore there is no indirect	for 2.5, but was not part of the law
			infringement either.	at the time of this paper

	Claim 3	Construction	Infringement Cleanio (Doc B)	Infringement Cleanipro (Doc B)
3.1	Apparatus	Apparatus which has all of the	Yes when dependent on claim 1	Yes when dependent on claim 1
	according to Claim	features of claim 1 or claim 1 + 2		
	1 or 2, comprising	plus those that follow	No when dependent on claim 2	No when dependent on claim 2
3.2	[when dependent	the bottom surface of the holding	Yes: lowermost surface slopes towards	Yes: lowermost surface slopes towards
	on claim 1]	tank is inclined to the horizontal,	pipe (see Fig A and page 9, line 13)	pipe (see Fig A and page 9, line 13)
		either towards or away from the		
	a wall sloping from	pipe		
	or to the pipe			
3.3	[when dependent	the top wall of the storage tank is	Yes: lowermost surface slopes towards	Yes: lowermost surface slopes towards
	on claim 2]	inclined to the horizontal either towards or away from the pipe	pipe (see Fig A and page 9, line 13)	pipe (see Fig A and page 9, line 13)
	a wall sloping from	towards of away from the pipe		
	or to the pipe			
			Additional features of claim 3 are present,	Additional features of claim 3 are present,
			therefore infringed when dependent on	therefore infringed when dependent on
			claim 1 but not infringed when	claim 1 but not infringed when
			dependent on claim 2	dependent on claim 2

	Claim 4	Construction	Infringement Cleanio (Doc B)	Infringement Cleanipro (Doc B)
4.1	Apparatus according to any preceding Claim	Apparatus which has all of the features of claim 1 or claim 2 or claim 3 (when dependent on claim 1 or claim 2) plus	Yes when dependent on claim 1 or claim 3 +1.	Yes when dependent on claim 1 or claim 3 +1.
	0	those that follow	No when dependent on claim 2 or 3 + 2	No when dependent on claim 2 or 3 + 2
4.2	wherein the filter material is a mesh,	the filter material is made from a network of threads or wires which define open passages of a regular size	Yes: the uppermost surface 4 is a plastic mesh material (page 9, line 26),	Yes: uppermost surface 4 is a flexible steel mesh (page 10, line 24)
4.3	typically	"typically" means that the features which follow are optional, and not limiting; it is unclear whether this applies to the material only, or also to the hole size	Non-limiting feature, therefore not required to be present for infringement.	Non-limiting feature, therefore not required to be present for infringement.
	fabricated from steel or other metal material	steel or other metal material = a metal or metal alloy (steel is just one example)	No: mesh is made of plastic, not metal (page 9, line 26)	Yes: uppermost surface 4 is a flexible steel mesh (page 10, line 24)
	having a mesh hole size of from 1 to 10 mm.	mesh hole size = the gaps between the threads or wires is within the range of 1 to 10mm	Mesh size is not stated; however the claimed range is quite broad and likely to be present since it is intended to retain the same sized objects (leaves etc, page 10, lines 13-14).	No: pore size is less than 1mm (page 10, line 25)
			The non-optional additional feature of claim 4 is present, therefore infringed / not infringed according to dependency.	The non-optional additional feature of claim 4 is present, therefore infringed / not infringed according to dependency.

Doc C published 1st December 2007, i.e. prior to 1st September 2010, so full prior art for both Novelty and Inv. Step.

	Claim 1	Construction	Novelty Figure 1 embodiment (Doc C)	Novelty Figure 2 embodiment (Doc C)
1.1	Apparatus for cleaning water, the	equipment suitable for cleaning water	Yes: Page 13, line 7	Yes: Page 15, lines 1-3
	apparatus comprising,			
1.2	a holding tank	a vessel in which water is retained for a period of time	Yes: upper portion UP of tubular tank 10 has circular baffles 19a, 19b which arrest the flow of water (page 13, lines 13-16); also fine filter causes water to back up into UP (page 14, lines 16-18), hence water is retained for a period of time	Yes: upper portion UP' of tubular tank 10' has baffles 19a', 19b' which arrest the flow of water in same way as Fig 1 embodiment, so water is retained for a period of time
	with a central aperture	a hole which is located approximately in the centre	Yes: the funnel portion 15 has a tube portion 18 at its centre through which water can flow. Page 13, lines 12-13 & 15	Yes: the tube portion 18' is approximately central as shown in Fig 2; water flows through it in same way as Fig 1
1.3	through which	generally vertical tube which	Yes: tube portion extends from below,	Yes: tube portion 18' extends vertically from
	extends an upstanding pipe,	runs from below, through the aperture, above it	through the conical portion and extends above it (Fig 1; page 13, lines 16-17). The tube portion is shown as vertical (Fig 1).	below, through the conical portion and extends above it (Fig 2).
1.4	the uppermost	top end of the tube acts as a	Yes: baffle 19b which is formed as an	Yes: baffle 19b' which is formed as an
	edge of which providing a weir	low dam which regulates the level and flow of water	extension of the tube arrests flow of water; page 13, lines 14-15	extension of the tube 18' arrests flow of water in same way as Fig 1
1.5	the holding tank	something which can	No: the Filter 16 is not located at the top /	Yes: Filter CF is located across the upper part
	having a filter	remove entrained detritus	entry to the holding tank (it is located in the	of UP'
	material provided across its top	at approximately the upper end of the holding tank	tube, i.e. the exit of the holding tank)	
	across its top	end of the holding tank	Not all features disclosed, therefore novel	All features disclosed, therefore not novel

	Claim 2	Construction	Novelty Figure 1 embodiment (Doc C)	Novelty Figure 2 embodiment (Doc C)
2.1	Water cleaning and storage apparatus, the apparatus comprising	equipment suitable for cleaning water and holding the cleaned water until it is used	Yes: Page 13, line 7	Yes: Page 15, lines 1-3
2.2	a water storage tank	a vessel for holding the cleaned water until it is used	Yes: lower portion LP of tubular tank 10 stores cleaned water	Yes: lower portion LP' of tubular tank 10' stores cleaned water
	having a top wall through which a pipe extends	a tube runs from below the upper surface of the storage tank, though and above it	Yes: the funnel portion 15 has a tube portion 18 which extends from below, through the funnel portion and above it (Fig 1; page 13, lines 12-13).	Yes: conical wall 17' has tube portion 18' (Fig 2)
2.3	one end of the pipe providing a weir	the part of the pipe above the top wall regulates the level and flow of water	Yes: baffle 19b which is formed as an extension of the tube arrests flow of water (page 13, lines 14-15)	Yes: baffle 19b' which is formed as an extension of the tube 18' arrests flow of water in same way as Fig 1
2.4	a peripheral wall upstands from the storage tank to provide a holding tank	outermost wall extends above the top wall of the storage tank so that together they form a vessel for temporarily retaining water	Yes: tubular tank 10 extends above lower portion LP to form upper portion UP in which water is retained by baffles 19a, 19b (page 13, lines 13-16)	Yes: tubular tank 10' extends above LP' to form UP' in which water is retained by baffles 19a', 19b' in same way as Fig 1
2.5	and wherein a filter material is secured over and between the peripheral wall	Filter material = something which removes entrained detritus attached to the peripheral wall and located above its upper edge and extending across the top of the holding tank	No: the Filter 16 is not attached to the wall of the tank 10, is not located above its upper edge and does not extend across the top of UP	No: Filter CF is not located above the upper edge of UP'
			Not all features disclosed, therefore novel	Not all features disclosed, therefore novel

P6 (FD4) 2013 Model Answer - novelty

	Claim 3	Construction	Novelty Figure 1 embodiment (Doc C)	Novelty Figure 2 embodiment (Doc C)
3.1	Apparatus according to Claim 1 or 2, comprising	Apparatus which has all of the features of claim 1 or claim 1 +	No when dependent on claim 1	Yes when dependent on claim 1
		2 plus those that follow	No when dependent on claim 2	No when dependent on claim 2
3.2	[when dependent on claim 1]	the bottom surface of the holding tank is inclined to the	Yes: conical wall 17 slopes towards the tube 18 (Fig 1)	Yes: 17' slopes towards the tube 18' (Fig 2)
	a wall sloping from or to the pipe	horizontal, either towards or away from the pipe		
3.3	[when dependent on claim 2]	the top wall of the storage tank is inclined to the	Yes: conical wall 17 slopes towards the tube 18 (Fig 1)	Yes: 17' slopes towards the tube 18' (Fig 2)
	a wall sloping from or to the pipe	horizontal either towards or away from the pipe		
			Additional features of claim 3 are present, but claim 3 is novel by virtue of its dependency on claim 1 / claim 2.	Additional features of claim 3 are present. Claim 3 is not novel when dependent on claim 1, but is novel by virtue of its dependency when dependent on claim 2.

	Claim 4	Construction	Novelty Figure 1 embodiment (Doc C)	Novelty Figure 2 embodiment (Doc C)
4.1	Apparatus according to any preceding Claim	Apparatus which has all of the features of claim 1 or claim 2 or claim 3 (when dependent on claim 1 or claim 2) plus those that follow	No when dependent on claim 1, claim 2, claim 3+1 or claim 3 + 2	Yes when dependent on claim 1 or claim 3+1 No when dependent on claim 2 or claim 3 + 2
4.2	wherein the filter material is a mesh,	the filter material is made from a network of threads or wires which define open passages of a regular size	No: filter 16 is not a mesh (page 13, lines 20-23)	No: not stated whether CF is a mesh or not since it is only stated to comprise a metal frame (page 15, line 11).
4.3	typically	"typically" means that the features which follow are optional, and not limiting; it is unclear whether this applies to the material only, or also to the hole size	Non-limiting feature, therefore not required to be present for infringement.	Non-limiting feature, therefore not required to be present for infringement.
	fabricated from steel or other metal material	steel or other metal material = a metal or metal alloy (steel is just one example)	No: no mention of metal (plastic is preferred page 13, lines 22-23)	Yes: metal frame (page 15, line 11)
	having a mesh hole size of from 1 to 10 mm.	mesh hole size = the gaps between the threads or wires is within the range of 1 to 10mm	No: since no mesh	No: no mention of hole size
			The non-optional additional feature of claim 4 is not present so claim 4 is novel; claim 4 is also novel by virtue of its dependency.	The non-optional additional feature of claim 4 is not present, so claim 4 is novel (for all dependencies).

P6 (FD4) 2013 Model Answer - inventive step

Inventive step

Apply the Pozzoli/Windsurfer approach:

The skilled person for claims 1-4 is a manufacturer/designer of water cleaning systems principally for rainwater harvesting.

The common general knowledge is the introductory paragraph of Document B (page 9, lines 3 to 7) and the background section of Document C (page 12, lines 9 -18) and also page 15, line 10 in relation to coarse filters.

Claim 1

The inventive concept is the combination of a weir (to allow fine particles to settle and a filter to remove coarse particles.

Starting from doc C, Fig 1 embodiment, the difference is the use of a coarse filter at top of holding tank for removing large particles.

This is known in doc C itself from the Fig 2 embodiment. Page 16, line 10 states that coarse filters are well known in the art.

Since the difference does not require any degree of invention and would have been obvious to the skilled person, claim 1 lacks inventive step over doc C in combination with the CGK (as stated in Doc C).

As set out above, I consider that claim 1 lacks novelty over the Figure 2 embodiment of doc C. However, if it were considered that the aperture in the holding tank is not central, this difference would also be obvious, since the position of the aperture has no technical significance, and is a routine variant for the skilled person, which would not be inventive.

Claim 2

The inventive concept is the particular location of the filter which allows the filter to support the weight of a person walking on it to clean it (page 6, line 17).

Starting from doc C, Fig 2 embodiment, the difference is that the filter is secured over the top of the upper edge of the holding tank.

This is feature is not taught anywhere in the CGK or document C, so claim 2 is inventive.

P6 (FD4) 2013 Model Answer - inventive step

Claim 3

The additional features of claim 3 are disclosed in both embodiments of Doc C. Therefore claim 3 is not independently inventive. It is inventive when dependent on claim 2 by virtue of dependency, but not when dependent on claim 1.

Claim 4

The inventive concept of the only essential feature of claim 4 is to use a mesh as the coarse filter. It is CGK to use a coarse filter to remove large particles (doc C, page 15, line 17). A mesh seems to be a well-known type of coarse filter.

The non-essential features (metal mesh, pore size of 1 - 10 mm) are also likely to be CGK.

Therefore claim 4 lacks inventive step.

Summary of infringement and validity

Claim 1 is infringed by both Cleanio and CleaniPro, and is novel, but is invalid for lack of inventive step.

Claim 2 is not infringed by Cleanio or CleaniPro. It is novel and inventive.

Claim 3 is infringed by both Cleanio and CleaniPro when dependent on claim 1, but not when dependent on claim 2. Claim 3 lacks inventive step when dependent on claim 1, but is valid when dependent on claim 2.

Claim 4 is infringed by both Cleanio and CleaniPro when dependent on claim 1 or 3+1, but not when dependent on claim 2 or 3+2. Claim 3 lacks inventive step when dependent on claim 1, but is valid when dependent on claim 2.

Amendment

Claim 1 could be amended to specify that the pipe / weir is slidably movable, based on page 5, lines 26-28. The amended claim would be infringed by both Cleanio (page 9, lines 17-23, page 10, lines 9 – 15 and Figs A & B) and CleaniPro, (10, line 20-22). The amended claim would be inventive because there is no suggestion in Doc C or the CGK to have a movable pipe / weir.

An alternative amendment would be to specify that the filter is cleaned by sweeping arms, based on page 6, line 20. This is less preferable because it would be infringed by CleaniPro (page 10, lines 25-27) but not by Cleanio. The amended claim would be inventive because there is no suggestion in Doc C or the CGK to have a sweeping arms.

P6 (FD4) 2013 Model Answer – sufficiency

Sufficiency

There are no sufficiency issues.

Advice

The Patent is in force and so the client could commence litigation (after sending a letter before action) straight away. The client must move fast if seeking an interim injunction, especially in light of CleaniPro.

Wasteaway are importing Cleanio – and will import CleaniPro. Wasteaway is an importer, so the client's discussion is not an actionable threat. A prima facie case for infringement exists.

The client is more established in the market especially with respect to commercial articles (despite disappointing sales). Wasteaway Cleanio product appears to be potentially commercially more successful than the patented product – think about licensing Cleanio.